Formative and Summative Assessment of Library Instruction (LI):
Encouraging and supporting "reflective teaching" practices through peer observation

Annual LOEX 2017

Bernadette M. López-Fitzsimmons
Associate Librarian
Instruction, Outreach, & Research
Manhattan College Library
Riverdale, NY 10417
1. Interesting and useful topic for professional, academic, and personal endeavors
2. Helpful in professional, academic, and personal learning
3. Requires guidance or mentoring at times
4. Individualized, creative, artistic, & intellectually stimulating
5. Practical and simple BUT systematic and organized
6. Promotes strategic planning for future library instruction lessons
7. Facilitates setting goals and being progressive
8. Proactive by taking action based on conscious, systematic self-reflections about library instruction
9. Fosters differentiated library instruction to address diverse learning styles and learning challenges
10. Prevents impulsiveness, boredom, lethargy, and stagnation.
TODAY’S TOPICS

– **Why self-reflection or critical reflection is the topic for today’s presentation?**
  – What is reflection?
  – Why reflect?

– **Formative and Summative Assessments in Peer Observations**
  – Library instructor’s self-reflection: Formative Assessment
  – Peer Observations: Formative and Summative Observations

– **Reflection Theories**
  – Reflective Practice + Action Research
  – Reflective Teaching
    – *Reflection-in action*
    – *Reflection-on-action*

– **Reflective Practice and Annual Reports**

– **Templates for Reflective Library Instruction Practices**
  – Reflection activity for formative assessment
  – Self-reflection: Tiered reflection activity
  – Self-reflection for action planning
  – Self-reflection for professional practice
  – Annual Report template based on reflective practice
**WHAT IS REFLECTION AS A TEACHING PRACTICE?**

- “the teacher’s thinking about what happens in classroom lessons and thinking about alternative means of achieving goals or aims”
  
  Cruickshank and Applegate (Kathleen M. Bailey, Andy Curtis & David Nunan, 2004)

- Teachers to think, analyze and objectively judge their classroom action.
- Teachers identify issues in the classroom, reflect on them, and think of solutions or ways to address these issues differently.
- Self-reflection of library instruction requires systematic, organized, ongoing observation of one’s (or others’) teaching.
- —Then, plan for the next action to take resolving a particular issue.
JOHN DEWEY (1859-1952)
“REFLECTIVE THINKING” CAUSES DISCOMFORT AND UNEASINESS.

– Reflection is clearly purposeful because it aims at a conclusion.
– The purpose of reflecting is to untangle a problem or to make more sense of a puzzling situation.
– Reflection involves working towards a better understanding of the problem and ways of solving it.

( Dewey as cited in Loughran, 1966).
1. What is reflection in teaching/library instruction?
2. What is the purpose of having a self-reflective library instruction practice?
What Is Reflection?

- Reflection is part of learning and thinking.
  - We reflect in order to learn something about our students’ learning or the dynamics of the classroom environment.
  - We learn as a result of reflecting, giving thoughtful consideration to an experience.
  - We are part of a “learning society,” always observing, analyzing, and adapting (Schön, 1987).
The term “reflective learning” emphasizes the intention to learn from current or prior experience (Moon, 2004).

The term “reflective teaching” is a process where teachers evaluate their own teaching practices:

- what is currently being done
- why is it being done
- how well students are learning.

“Reflective teaching” involves the following:

- Analyzing how something was taught and its outcome
- Examining how the practice might be improved or changed
- Applying differentiated instruction methodologies for better learning outcomes.
What Is A Self-reflective Teaching Practice?

- Engaging teachers in a self-study about their own teaching practices and their own classroom learning environment.
- Self-reflective teaching practice must be a consistent, regular, systematic, evaluative practice that speaks to the two stages of a lesson:
  1. Planning and organizing a lesson.
  2. Executing the plan. Presenting a lesson following the new action plan.

(Roffey-Barentsen & Malthouse, [p. 163], 2013)
REFLECTIVE LIBRARY INSTRUCTION

1. What are we doing now in class?
2. Why is the lesson(s) being taught this way?
3. How well are students learning? What are the learning gaps?
4. How are we identifying whether learning is taking place?
5. What are we going to do about this to maximize learning outcomes?

1. Analyze how something was taught and examine the learning outcomes.
2. Consider other methodologies and strategies that might improve learning outcomes.
3. Organize and plan the new approach.
4. Executive the new teaching and learning technique(s).
TO SELF-REFLECT OR NOT TO SELF-REFLECT ON LIBRARY INSTRUCTION?

With or without self-reflection
What to consider in self-reflection
### To Self-Reflect Or Not?

#### WITH SELF-REFLECTION

1. Teachers who self-reflect should follow a systematic, conscious process (Dewey, 1933).
2. Teachers who self-reflect make informed decisions about their teaching based on awareness, development, and growth (Dewey, 1933).

#### WITHOUT SELF-REFLECTION

1. Teachers who do not reflect on their own work becomes slaves to the same routine (Dewey, 1933).
2. Teachers who do not reflect are driven by impulse, tradition, and/or authority (Dewey, 1933).
WHAT TO CONSIDER IN A SELF-REFLECTIVE LIBRARY INSTRUCTION PRACTICE?

1. Take into account student population, educational level, intellectual acumen, organizational and planning skills, cultural and linguistic challenges.
2. Be aware of learning styles, learning challenges, teaching strategies, teaching & learning tools, etc.
3. Rotate around the room to observe that everyone is engaged.
4. Prepare leveled and differentiated teaching and learning materials: vary activities from partner/small group work, pair share TO individualized work TO whole class share
5. Have some method of taking notes for yourself: clip board, Google docs, post its, etc.
6. Get feedback from students: evaluation form or exit slip.
7. Use your notes and feedback from students and/or teaching faculty in your self-reflections.
The most challenging thing was ...

Today I discovered ....

Today I asked ....

Today I was unsuccessful because ....

I wonder ....

The most difficult thing was

Today I was successful because....

Today I was successful because ....

Today I was successful because ....
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Today I taught</strong></th>
<th><strong>Today I was successful with</strong></th>
<th><strong>Today I was not successful with</strong></th>
<th><strong>Today’s student feedback indicates</strong></th>
<th><strong>Next time, I will try</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Without technology for twenty minutes</td>
<td>Engaging students. They worked at their computers as I moved around the room.</td>
<td>Showing students how to submit an interlibrary loan form from the online catalog.</td>
<td>They were able to use Google Scholar, the Journal List, and the online catalog. Some need more help. Others missed the entire activity.</td>
<td>To include Worldcat. Students seem advanced enough to move to an additional source.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Teachable Moments!

Great Opportunities to Engage Students

1. Teachable moments should be included in self-reflections
2. Teachable moments inform library instructors what students know and do not know.
3. Teachable moments facilitate building new knowledge on prior knowledge.
4. Teachable moments provide feedback on what the next plan of action should be.
# Formative and Summative Assessments in Peer Observations

1. Self-Assessment: Formative (Library Instructor’s own)
2. Peer Observation: Formative Assessment (by invitation)
3. Peer Observation: Summative Assessment (assigned)
What is formative assessment?

1. **Formative assessment**, including diagnostic testing, is a range of **formal and informal assessment** procedures conducted by library instructors during the learning process in order to **modify teaching and learning activities to improve student learning outcomes**.

2. **Formative assessment** facilitates differentiating within a lesson.

3. **Formative assessment** can be done through self-reflective teaching practices and inviting another individual for a peer observation.

4. **Formative assessment** helps professional development, remaining current in teaching methodologies and strategies.

5. **Formative assessment** is a preparatory process for the summative assessment which is often assigned and more formal.

6. **Formative assessment** includes your observations, students’ contributions about your teaching and the presentation of the topic, or observations done by colleague(s) who have been invited to your class.
Library Instructor Self-reflection: Formative Assessment

- Select a method that is easy for you to follow a daily practice (e.g., clipboard, notebook, Google docs, notepad, post its, etc.)
- **Develop a system** for taking notes during class time or as you rotate around the class.
- **Take time to think about your notes**
- Discuss with a colleague or administrator:
  - what you did
  - why you did it
  - what the learning outcomes were
- Be **consistent and regular** in writing your reflections
- Be **systematic and organized** in differentiating instruction and experimenting with various teaching and learning tools.
KEY POINTS: REFLECTIVE LIBRARY INSTRUCTION

- “Critical reflection -- powerful tool for the improvement of teaching practice”
- Use of personal reflections, planning, organizing, observing
- Feedback from students and other sources such as cross-collaboration partners such as librarians, teaching faculty, and academic support services colleagues.
- Library instructors might not automatically engage in sound self-reflection like teaching faculty do:
  - Because librarians’ work might be perceived as service-oriented rather than purposeful teaching. (Lupton, 2012)
An observer’s feedback helps to focus on strategic reflective thinking:

1. **Clarification**: clarifying and describing the problem.
2. **Analysis**: analyzing the possible causes.
3. **Deliberation**: considering alternatives.
4. **Selection**: choosing one.
5. **Initiation**: putting it into practice.
6. **Evaluation**: evaluating whether the problem has been resolved or not.

(Roffey-Barentsen & Malthouse, 2013, [p. 13])
Peer Observation: Formative Assessment

1. Formative assessment can be done by
2. Library instructor’s own observation and reflective practices
3. Formative evaluation by a colleague invited to observe your class
4. Informal feedback for guidance, mentoring, or coaching
5. Usually, you invite the observer to evaluate your teaching
6. Feedback facilitates preparing for the summative assessment which is formal, assigned, and used for Promotion & Tenure and administrative reporting
7. Facilitates making changes in teaching because the observer has a “critical lens”

(Stenhouse, 1975)
Peer Observation: Summative Assessment

- Summative assessment will review librarians’ overall teaching performance.
  - more prescribed
  - more formal
  - Usually observer(s) are assigned to observe you.
- Prepare for summative assessment through feedback from formative assessments.
- Summative assessment is used in
  - professional reviews of library instructors for continued appointment, tenure, or promotion
  - administrative reporting

(Snavely & Dewald, 2011, p. 343)
REFLECTION THEORIES

1. Reflective Practice + Action Research (Mertler, 2017)
2. Reflection-in-action + Reflection-on-action (Schön, 1987)
Reflection Theories

1. Reflective learning
2. Reflective teaching
3. Reflective writing
4. Reflective professional practice
5. Reflective thinking (Dewey, 1933)
6. Critical reflection practice
7. Self-reflective practices

1. The reflective practitioner
2. The reflective professional
3. The reflective teacher
4. The reflective library instructor
5. The reflective administrator
Reflective Practice Applied to Action Research

1. “Vested interest in the teaching and learning process or environment”

2. Purpose of gathering information about
   -- how their particular schools operate
   -- how they teach
   -- how their students learn”
   (Mills as cited in Mertler, 2017)

3. Library instructors must be engaged in their own learning as well as their teaching
   (Parsons & Brown as cited in Mertler, 2017)
**Action Research: Iterative and Cyclic**

A spiral of steps involving **planning, taking action, collecting and analyzing data.**

1. The planning stage.
2. The acting stage.
3. The developing stage.
4. The reflecting stage.

(Mertler & Charles as cited in Mertler, 2017)

**Library Reports and Publications**

1. Qualitative data
2. Quantitative data
3. Mixed methods data
Donald Schön (1930-1997)
Reflection-in-action or Thinking on Our Feet

Schön’s Theories
Technical Knowledge vs. Practitioner Knowledge

1. Practical knowledge that educators know about teaching & learning
2. Professional knowledge develops during action or active engagement

Reflection-in action:
Applying theories as we teach

1. Looking to our experiences
2. Connecting with our feelings
3. Attending to our theories in use

Building new understandings to inform our actions in the situation that is unfolding. (Schön, 1987)
Donald Schön (1930-1997)  
Reflection-on-action

1. Workers may write up recordings, talk things through with a supervisor and so on.
2. We develop sets of questions and ideas about our activities and practice.

The act of reflecting-on-action enables us to spend time exploring
1. why we acted as we did,
2. what was happening in a group

(Schön, 1987)
Reflection-in-action (thinking on our feet) + Reflection-on-action

1. Practitioners build up a collection of images, ideas, examples and actions that they can draw upon. (Schön, 1987)

2. Library instructors build up a collection of strategies, methodologies, techniques, teaching and learning tools, materials, etc.

3. They draw up these items as they are teaching.

4. Self-reflection and action research allow them to develop a fluid teaching practice.
Reflective Practice and Annual Reports

This practice can also be applied to pre-tenure review applications.
Reflective Practice and Annual Reports

1) Library Instructions Sessions Taught

Library director’s note: Insert or delete rows, as necessary, by clicking anywhere in the table and using Table Tools — Layout — Delete or Insert Below.

**Fall 2016**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Course Number and Name</th>
<th>#Students</th>
<th>Course Instructor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Teaching

- Includes noteworthy accomplishments in existing courses, new courses taught, curriculum development, new pedagogy employed, utilizing new technologies, new assessment strategies, the addition of experiential elements, etc. Please list all course-imbedded community-service.

- Library director’s note: Library work not included as scholarship or service should appear either here or in (5) Other Accomplishments, below. Please be sure to include all accomplishments that have helped improve library collections or services.
3) **Scholarship**
Includes publications, professional and/or academic presentations, funding sought or awarded, papers under review, awards, grants, etc.

---

4) **Service**
Includes service to department, school, college, community (including service projects organized by students clubs you advise), and/or profession.

---

5) **Other Accomplishments**
*(Please describe other accomplishments not included above.)*
TEMPLATES FOR REFLECTIVE LIBRARY INSTRUCTION PRACTICES

Library instructor self-reflection
Peer observation: formative and summative assessment
Action research: qualitative, quantitative, or mixed methods
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Table 1: Formative Assessment in Peer Observation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reflection Activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Have you ever been observed by a peer or an administrator?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Have you ever conducted a peer observation of a library instructor?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Describe your experience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>What activity was decided upon to improve or modify your teaching? What was the result of implementing this change?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(From: Barentsen & Maltby, 2013)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Formative Assessment in Self-Evaluation Tiered Reflection Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Identify an area you would like to improve. Based on your self-evaluation and/or student feedback, identify an area of your teaching practice you would like to change.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 2. | Pose a question that has arisen from this issue. Combine the question with the issue to formulate a hypothesis.  
**Example:**  
**Question:** How can I engage students in searching for a variety of materials for their research project?  
**Answer:** Give the students extra credit.  
**Hypothesis:** Giving the students extra credit will engage them in searching for a variety of materials for their research project. |
| 3. | Conduct a research investigation in professional and scholarly, peer-reviewed journals for ways to test the hypothesis in your classroom. |
| 4. | Decide on an action or approach you can undertake to resolve the issue. |
| 5. | Implement the action or approach. Collect data to describe or measure the outcomes of the action or approach undertaken. |
| 6. | Analyze the data. Discuss with a colleague, peer, or supervisor. Plan for the next action. |

*(Roffey-Barensen & Maltbouse, 2013)*
Self-reflection for Action Planning

**STEP 1.**
The purpose of my study is/was

**STEP 2.**
My research question(s) are

**STEP 3**
A summary of my research findings include:

**STEP 4**
Something I learned from my study was:

**STEP 5**
Recommendations for changes to my teaching practice include:

**STEP 6**
Recommendations for the future cycles of action research include:

Adapted from *Action Research: Improving Schools and Empowering Educators*, by Craig A. Mertler. Copyright 2017, p. 313.
Step 1. The purpose of my study was...

Step 2. I learned the following about my initial problem:

Step 3. Things I learned about my professional practice are...

Step 4. Things I learned about action research are

Step 5. Things I learned about myself include

Step 6. When I conduct action research again, I will...

Adapted from Action Research: Improving Schools and Empowering Educators, by Craig A. Mertler. Copyright 2017, p. 314.
# Annual Faculty Activity & Progress Report

## Academic Year 2016-17

Due to Department/Program Chair by April 15, 2017

---

Please highlight activities related to Faculty Development Plan, if applicable

(The form will expand as needed)

---

**Name:**

**Department:**

**Rank:**

Please indicate if you are a Department Chair or Program Director:

---

### 1) Library Instructions Sessions Taught

Library director’s note: Insert or delete rows, as necessary, by clicking anywhere in the table and using Table Tools — Layout — Delete or Insert Below.

**Fall 2016**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Course Number and Name</th>
<th>#Students</th>
<th>Course Instructor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Spring 2017**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Course Number and Name</th>
<th>#Students</th>
<th>Course Instructor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

### 2) Teaching

- Includes noteworthy accomplishments in existing courses, new courses taught, curriculum development, new pedagogy employed, utilizing new technologies, new assessment strategies, the addition of experiential elements, etc. Please list all course-included community-service.

Library director’s note: Library work not included as scholarship or service should appear either here or in (5) Other Accomplishments, below. Please be sure to include all accomplishments that have helped improve library collections or services.

---

### 3) Scholarship

- Includes publications, professional and/or academic presentations, funding sought or awarded, papers under review, awards, grants, etc.

---

### 4) Service

- Includes service to department, school, college, community (including service projects organized by students clubs you advise), and/or profession.

---

### 5) Other Accomplishments

*(Please describe other accomplishments not included above.)*

---

**Date submitted:**
“Self-reflection improves educator effectiveness through ongoing, careful consideration of the impact of teaching practice on student growth and achievement.

When teachers use documented evidence to pinpoint what worked, what did not work, and what types of changes they might make to be more successful, self-reflection enhances the ability to adopt practical changes that improve instruction.”


Your turn to share!

Comments?

Questions?

Personal experiences to share?
Bernadette M. López-Fitzsimmons
Associate Librarian
Instruction, Outreach, & Research
Manhattan College Library
Riverdale, NY 10417
bernadette.lopez@manhattan.edu

THANK YOU!